

""""VCD'D

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO  
EASTERN DIVISION**

JACOB SMITH,	)	Case No. 2:20-cv-03755
	)	
Plaintiff,	)	
	)	Judge Edmund A. Sargus
v.	)	Magistrate Judge Kimberly A. Jolson
	)	
FIRSTENERGY CORP., <i>et al.</i> ,	)	
	)	
Defendants.	)	
<hr style="width: 40%; margin-left: 0;"/>	)	

JAMES BULDAS,	)	Case No. 2:20-cv-03987
	)	
Plaintiff,	)	Judge Edmund A. Sargus
	)	Magistrate Judge Kimberly A. Jolson
v.	)	
	)	
FIRSTENERGY CORP., <i>et al.</i> ,	)	
	)	
Defendants.	)	
<hr style="width: 40%; margin-left: 0;"/>	)	

BRIAN HUDOCK and CAMEO COUNTERTOPS, INC.,	)	Case No. 2:20-cv-03954
	)	
Plaintiffs,	)	Judge Edmund A. Sargus
	)	Magistrate Judge Kimberly A. Jolson
v.	)	
	)	
FIRSTENERGY CORP., <i>et al.</i> ,	)	
	)	
Defendants.	)	
<hr style="width: 40%; margin-left: 0;"/>	)	

**DECLARATION OF DENNIS E. MURRAY, JR. IN SUPPORT OF AWARD OF  
ATTORNEYS' FEES, REIMBURSEMENT OF EXPENSES, AND AWARD OF  
INCENTIVE PAYMENTS TO CLASS REPRESENTATIVES**

I, Dennis E. Murray, Jr, declare as follows:

1. I am an attorney licensed to practice before the courts of the State of Ohio, and am a Partner in the law firm of Murray & Murray Co., L.P.A. (“Murray & Murray”). I have personal knowledge of the facts stated in this Declaration and, if called as a witness, I would testify competently to them. I make this Declaration in support of Murray & Murray’s request for attorneys’ fees and reimbursement of litigation expenses, as set forth in Class Plaintiffs’ Motion For Award of Attorneys’ Fees, Costs, And Incentive Awards To Class Representative Plaintiffs (ECF No. 145).

2. I am counsel of record in this case for plaintiffs Jacob Smith, Brian Hudock, and Cameo Countertops, Inc.

3. A brief description my firm, which includes a short summary of my experience and credentials, is attached as Exhibit 1 and incorporated herein by reference.

4. Throughout the course of this litigation, my firm kept files contemporaneously documenting all time spent, including tasks performed, and expenses incurred, and shared those reports on a regular basis with Dennis E. Murray, Jr. and Marvin A. Miller, who are Class Counsel for the Settlement Class, along with James L. Ward, Jr.. *See* ECF No. 142 (preliminary approval order appointing Messrs. Murray, Miller, and Ward as Class Counsel). All the time and expenses reported by my firm advanced the tremendous class-wide result achieved in this case.

5. Such work included every aspect of the litigation from preparing the complaint, working on discovery issues, opposing the FirstEnergy defendants’ motion to dismiss, moving for class certification, defending the deposition of one of the class representatives, opposing Energy Harbor’s motion for judgment on the pleadings, leading settlement preparation, negotiation with opposing counsel, and the preparation and modification of a detailed set of documents necessary to both reduce the two settlement agreements to writing and prepare them for presentation to the

Court including all aspects of class notice.

6. The schedule attached as Exhibit 2, and incorporated herein, is a detailed summary of the amount of time spent by my firm's partners, attorneys, and professional support staff who were involved in this litigation. It does not include any time devoted to preparing this Declaration or otherwise pertaining to the fee petition. The lodestar calculation is based on my firm's billing rates in effect at the time services were performed. Exhibit 2 was prepared from contemporaneous time records regularly prepared and maintained by my firm. Those records have been provided to Class Counsel, and I authorize them to be submitted for inspection by the Court if necessary.

7. The total number of hours reasonably expended on this litigation by my firm from inception to July 31, 2022, which does not include time spent preparing this Declaration or preparing Class Plaintiffs' fee petition, is 1,180.55 hours. The total lodestar for my firm at current rates is \$528,373.75. Expense items are billed separately and are not duplicated in my firm's lodestar.

8. The expenses my firm incurred in litigating this action are reflected in the books and records of my firm. These books and records are prepared from expense vouchers, invoices, receipts, check records, and other source materials and accurately reflect the expenses incurred. My firm's expense records are available for inspection by the Court if necessary.

9. My firm incurred a total of \$11,759.76 in unreimbursed expenses, all of which were reasonable and necessary for the prosecution of this litigation. Of this amount, \$10,500 was for assessment payments for common litigation expenses or direct payments to experts or other vendors made at the request of Marvin Miller or as directed by me, and an additional \$1,1126.06 was for non-common litigation expenses incurred by my firm, such as filing fees, on-line PACER research, meals, parking, copying, telephone, telephone, etc. A summary of those expenses by category is attached as Exhibit 3. We assessed our collective firms a total of \$48,000, and have

incurred expenses in the amount of \$37,564,70, leaving a positive balance of \$6,300.62. This detail is available if requested by the Court.

10. In the event my firm provides additional services or incurs additional costs, I will supplement this declaration.

I declare under penalty and perjury that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed this 10<sup>th</sup> day of October, 2022, in Sandusky, Ohio.

/s Dennis E. Murray, Jr.  
Dennis E. Murray, Jr.

**MURRAY & MURRAY CO., L.P.A.**  
**111 E. SHORELINE DRIVE**  
**SANDUSKY, OHIO 44870**  
**[www.murrayandmurray.com](http://www.murrayandmurray.com)**  
**(419) 624-3000**

The Sandusky law firm of Murray & Murray was founded in 1931 by Emmett Murray and his brother Thomas Murray. The firm presently has eleven lawyers exclusively practicing civil complex litigation. Seven of the lawyers are Murrays.

**PROFESSIONAL BIOGRAPHY OF MURRAY & MURRAY**

**DENNIS E. MURRAY, SR.** received a Juris Doctor degree from the University of Michigan Law School. He received his undergraduate degree from The College of Holy Cross. He has been a licensed and practicing plaintiffs' trial lawyer since 1963. He is also an inactive licensed, certified public accountant; licensed to practice in the U.S. Supreme Court and many of the federal and appellate courts; a member of the Bars of the States of Ohio, Florida, and Michigan and is a member of the Ohio Society of Certified Public Accountants and of the Ohio Association of Justice. He has had extensive jury trial practice for more than 50 years; receiving multi-million dollar jury verdict awards for trials involving bad faith insurance company misconduct, tortious interference with contractual rights, negligent training and negligent discharge of firearms; commercial and securities litigation and for automobile and motorcycle liability. He has received the highest jury awards in many categories in the State of Ohio and has had extensive trial and appellate practice in business and commercial litigation; has been lead counsel in multi-million dollar resolutions of litigation concerning securities, leveraged buyouts, insurance; motor vehicles and consumer fraud and has litigated numerous class actions in the areas of employment discrimination, toxic torts, and commercial litigation in state and federal courts for more than 4 decades. His name appears as lead counsel in numerous cases decided by the Ohio Supreme Court in the last 50 years, including the issues of class certification; toxic torts; jury trial entitlement; insurance company duties to insureds and to injured parties; duties owing to minority shareholders; exclusivity of "fair cash value" in squeeze out mergers; whistle blower protection; labor organization liability for tortious misconduct; punitive damage standards and many other extremely significant legal issues. Mr. Murray is recognized as a "Super Lawyer" in Ohio and in 2015 was awarded the "Lifetime Achievement Award" by the Ohio Association for Justice.

**DENNIS E. MURRAY, JR.** received a Juris Doctor cum laude degree from Georgetown University Law School in 1987. He received a Bachelor of Arts, magna cum laude, from Georgetown University in 1984, Phi Beta Kappa. He is licensed to practice law in the State of Ohio, the United States District Court for the Northern District of Ohio, and Sixth Circuit U.S. Court of Appeals. He is the Co-author of *Corporate Constituencies: Whose Corporation Is It Anyway*, *The Corporate Analyst*; *The Unconstitutionality of Sovereign Immunity in Ohio: Last Stand for the Illegitimate King*. He served as a Grader for the Ohio Bar Examinations from 1995-2005; the Ohio Supreme Court Traffic Rules Committee from 1990 to 1994; the Erie-Huron

Grievance Committee from 1992-2006; as a General Assembly representative to the Ohio Supreme Court's Court Funding Task Force from 2011-13. He served as the State Representative for the 80th District in the Ohio House of Representatives from 2009-2012, as a member of Ohio's Constitutional Modernization Commission from 2011-13 and as a Sandusky City Commissioner from 2006-2008 and 2014-present (president 2008 and 2014-2019; vice-president 2020). He has been AV rated for over twenty years and has been recognized as an Ohio "Super Lawyer" for many years. He practices in Complex Civil Litigation including investor, class action, banking, antitrust, consumer issues and legal malpractice and fraud.

**CHARLES M. MURRAY** received a Juris Doctor degree from the University of Dayton in 1991. He received a Bachelor of Arts degree from Xavier University in 1987. He worked as the Assistant Prosecuting Attorney in the Adult Felony Trial Division in Erie County from 1991 to 1993. He is licensed to practice law in the State of Ohio, the U.S. District Court for the Northern District of Ohio, Sixth Circuit U.S. Court of Appeals. He is board certified as a Civil Trial Advocate by the National Board of Trial Advocacy. He is a member of the Erie County and Ohio State Bar Associations; the Cleveland Academy of Trial Lawyers; American Association for Justice; and Ohio Association for Justice. He is a member of the National College of Advocacy and the National Board of Trial Advocates. He was appointed by Ohio Supreme Court to service on the Task Force for Jury Service from 2002 to 2004. He is a member of the Erie County Public Defenders' Board, the Sandusky Central Catholic School Board and the State Theatre Board. He practices in Personal Injury, Wrongful Death, Medical Malpractice, and Plaintiffs' Trial Practice.

**MARGARET M. MURRAY** received a Juris Doctor degree as a merit scholar from Case Western Reserve University in 1996. She received a Bachelor of Arts degree from College of The Holy Cross in 1993. She is licensed to practice law in the State of Ohio, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, U.S. District Court for the Northern District of Ohio, U.S. District Court for the Southern District of Ohio, U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of Michigan, and Sixth Circuit U.S. Court of Appeals. She is a member of the Erie County and Ohio State Associations. She is a former Trustee of the Ohio Association for Justice and is a member of the American Association for Justice. She worked as an Assistant Prosecuting Attorney for Erie County from 1996 to 1997. Appointed by U.S. Senators Sherrod Brown and George Voinovich, she served on the United State Senate Judicial Nominations Committee for the Southern District of Ohio from 2009-2012. She was reappointed to that Commission by U.S. Senators Sherrod Brown and Rob Portman in 2016. In 2017, Margaret was appointed to the U.S. Senate Judicial Nominations Commission for the State of Ohio by Senators Brown and Portman. She has lectured on Federal Multi-District Litigation, subrogation, civil procedure, class actions, insurance law, ethics, product liability and brief writing. She is a former president of the Second Harvest Food Bank of North Central Ohio. She was appointed as a member of the Ohio State Bar Association Special Committee on Subrogation and as a member of the Ohio State Bar Association Subrogation Task Force. She is also a member of the OSBA Legal Ethics and Professional Conduct Committee and currently served on the Erie-Huron County Joint Certified Grievance Committee from 2011-2020 (Chair 2015-2016). She served as the Chair of the Ohio Association for Justice Covid-19 Immunity Task Force in 2020. Margaret has served as the Amicus Curiae Chair for the Ohio Association of Justice since 2009. Margaret has served a Commissioner on the Erie County MetroParks Board since 2016. She practices in Personal Injury, Complex Litigation, Class Actions, and Wrongful Death.

**JAMES L. MURRAY** received a Juris Doctor degree from Case Western Reserve University in 1997. He received a Bachelor of Arts degree from Boston College in 1994. He is licensed to practice law in the State of Ohio and the U.S. District Court for the Northern District of Ohio. He is a member of the Erie County, Ohio State and American Bar Associations. He is a member of the Ohio Association for Justice and the American Association for Justice. He worked as an Assistant Prosecuting Attorney in the Felony Division of Cuyahoga County from 1998-2002. He served nine years on the Legal Aid of Western Ohio and Advocates for Basic Equality Board of Trustees including four years as Vice President. He is the current Vice Chair of the Erie County Democratic Party, is a member of the Wightman Wieber Foundation Board of Trustees and sits on the Huron Baseball Softball Program Board. His practice areas include Personal Injury, Discrimination, Wrongful Death, Breach of Contract and Criminal Defense.

**FLORENCE A. MURRAY** joined the firm in 2011. She received her Juris Doctor degree from the Michael E. Moritz College of Law at the Ohio State University in 2005 where she received the James F. Flynn Memorial, Wilbert G. and Hilma R. Schwer, and Women Lawyers of Franklin County scholarships. She also holds a Masters in Business Administration from the Weatherhead School of Management at Case Western Reserve University, M.Ed Ashland University and a Bachelors of Arts from Saint Ignatius of Loyola University in Baltimore, Maryland. She is licensed to practice in the State of Ohio, U.S. District Court for the Northern District of Ohio, and Sixth Circuit U.S. Court of Appeals. She is a member of the Cleveland Academy of Trial Lawyers, and Erie County, Cleveland Metropolitan, Ohio State, Disability Rights, Education Law and American Bar Associations. She is a Trustee of the Ohio Association for Justice where she is the former Chair of the Ohio Trucking Safety Section, and, within the American Association for Justice, she is the Secretary for the Civil Rights Section and Newsletter Editor for the Railroad Section. She practices in the areas of Civil Rights, Railroad Law, Trucking Crashes, Wrongful Deaths, Class Actions and Insurance Law.

**NOLAN E. MURRAY** joined the firm in 2021 and represents the first member of the fourth generation of the Murray family to join the law firm. Nolan received his Juris Doctor degree from the Michael E. Moritz College of Law at The Ohio State University in 2018. He earned a Bachelor of Business Administration, magna cum laude, from the University of Notre Dame, in 2014. Nolan is a Certified Public Accountant. He is licensed to practice in the State of Ohio, the U.S. District Court for the Northern District of Ohio, and the Sixth Circuit U.S. Court of Appeals. He is a member of the Ohio State Bar Association and the Erie County Bar Association. His practice areas include Personal Injury, Wrongful Death, Breach of Contract, Consumer Law, Real Estate Leasing and Transactions Advice as well as General Corporate representation, including formation, structuring and contract review.

**WILLIAM H. BARTLE** received a Juris Doctor degree from Case Western Reserve University in 1975. He received a Bachelor of Arts from Hamilton College in 1971. He attended the Albany Law School of Union University. He is licensed to practice law in the State of Ohio, U.S. District Court for the Northern District of Ohio, Sixth Circuit U.S. Court of Appeals, and U.S. Supreme Court. He is a member of the Erie County and Ohio State Bar Associations. He practices in Personal Injury Law, Products Liability Law, Insurance Coverage Contract



Interpretation Law, Employment Discrimination Law, and Plaintiffs' Trial Practice.

**DONNA JEAN EVANS** received a Juris Doctor degree magna cum laude from Cleveland State University in 2000. She received a Bachelor of Arts degree cum laude from Marian College in 1975. She is licensed to practice law in the State of Ohio and U.S. District Court for the Northern and Southern Districts of Ohio and the Sixth Circuit. She is a member of the Erie County and Ohio State Bar Associations. She practices in Complex Litigation, Commercial, and Class Actions.

**JOSEPH A. GALEA** received a Juris Doctor degree from Case Western Reserve University in 2012 and a Bachelors of Arts from the University of Florida as a National Merit Scholar in 2008. He is licensed to practice law in the State of Ohio, the U.S. District Court for the Northern District of Ohio, and the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Sixth Circuit. He is a member of the Erie County and Ohio State Bar Associations, the Ohio Association for Justice, and the American Association for Justice. He is the Secretary of the Erie-Huron Joint Certified Grievance Committee and a commissioner on the City of Sandusky Planning Commission. He has prosecuted attorney discipline cases to the Ohio Board of Professional Conduct. He practices in Commercial and Complex Litigation, Personal Injury, Railroad Litigation, and Employment Litigation.

**MATTHEW R. JANACK** received a Juris Doctor degree from the University of Toledo in 2019 and a Bachelor of Arts in Political Science from the University of Akron. He received the Judge James Carr Writing Award in 2019 and is a member of the Ohio State and Erie County Bar Associations.

Murray & Murray has a very active appellate practice, including a total of over 50 published cases before the Ohio Supreme Court and over 100 published decisions in Ohio. These cases frequently include issues of great social and public importance. Murray & Murray attorneys appear regularly in the Supreme Court of the State of Ohio, appellate districts throughout the State of Ohio, U. S. District Courts, and U.S. Courts of Appeals.

Our firm has embraced technologies that maintain a lawyer's competitive edge. The professionalism of the lawyers at Murray & Murray has allowed the firm to enjoy relationships with opposing counsel that also work for the benefit of the respective clients by speeding litigation, lowering costs and reducing some of the less productive aspects of modern litigation.

The experience of Murray & Murray in class action work has been extensive. Murray & Murray has been actively involved in class litigation almost 50 years. Examples of some of the cases include:

- *Biechele v. Norfolk & Western Railway Co.*, 309 F.Supp. 354 (N.D. Ohio 1969) (environmental)
- *Nemitz v. Norfolk & Western Railway Co.*, 404 U.S. 37, 30 L. Ed. 2d 198, 92 S. Ct. 185, 62 Ohio Op. 2d 29, 78 L.R.R.M. 2721; 66 Lab. Cas. (CCH) ¶12, 183 (1971) (union employee wages)

- *Manning v. Int'l Union and General Motors*, 466 F.2d 812 (C.A. 6, 1972) (Title VII)
- *Raschaks v. General Motors*, 9 Fair Empl. Case No. 1406 (N.D. Ohio 1973) (employment)
- *Frank v. Vulcan Materials Co.*, C.A. No. E-81-16 (Erie Co. Ohio 1981) (environmental)
- *Frazier v. Gold Bond Building Products Co.*, Sandusky County Case No. 79-CV-185 (Ohio 1981) (environmental)
- *Clark v. Pfizer, Inc.*, C.A. No. S-84-7 (Sandusky Co. Ohio 1984) (environmental)
- *Sally V. Neff, et al. v. Celanese Piping Systems, et al.*, Franklin County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 85-CV-04-2279 (Ohio)
- *Harrell v. Marathon Oil Co.*, 32 Ohio St.3d 397, 513 N.E.2d 776 (1987) (securities)
- *Nickels, et al. v. Cedar Point, Inc., et al.*, Erie County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 45323 (Ohio 1987) (securities)
- *Gergely, et al. v. VanVoorhis, et al.*, Erie County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 87-CV-469 (Ohio) (securities)
- *Warner, et al. v. Waste Management, Inc., et al.*, 36 Ohio St. 3d 91, 521 N.E.2d 1091 (1988) (environmental)
- *Pippert v. Akron Coca Cola Bottling*, Erie County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 88-CV-070 (Ohio)
- *Limberios v. Vermilion River Resorts*, Lorain County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 88-CV-101212 (Ohio 1988) (consumer)
- *In re Trustcorp Securities Litigation*, U.S. Dist. Court Case No. 3:89CV7139 (N.D. Ohio 1990) (securities, fraud-on-the-market)
- *Schiller v. BancOhio National Bank*, Franklin County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 90CVH07-5340 (Ohio) (duties of indenture trustee)
- *Dowling v. Narragansett Capital Corp.*, 735 F. Supp. 1105 (D.R.I. 1990) (proxy fraud; investment banking negligence in connection with corporate takeover)
- *Bettis v. Ruetgers-Nease*, U.S. Dist. Court Case No. 4:90-CV-0502 (N.D. Ohio 1990) (environmental contamination)
- *Glatz, et al. v. Dublin Securities, Inc., et al.*, Erie County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 91-CV-274 (Ohio 1991) (state securities law)
- *Kitchen v. Aristech Chemicals*, 769 F.Supp. 254 (S.D. Ohio 1991) (environmental contamination)
- *Glatz, et al. v. Beaman, et al.*, Erie County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 92-CV-058 (Ohio 1992) (state securities law)
- *Polikoff v. Adam*, 67 Ohio St.3d 100 (1993) (shareholder derivative suit)
- *Miner, et al. v. Figgie, et al.*, Lake County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 93-CV-001575, C.A. No. 94-L-069 (Ohio 1993) (derivative stockholder litigation)
- *Vettel v. Bank One Sidney*, Erie County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 93-CV-155 (Ohio 1993) (consumer)

- *McConocha v. Blue Cross Blue Shield of Ohio*, U.S. Dist. Court Case No. 3:93-CV-7534 (N.D. Ohio 1993) (consumer insurance, 80/20 co-pay)
- *Shaver v. Standard Oil Co.*, 89 Ohio App.3d 52 (1993) (consumer; antitrust)
- *Kreidler v. Western Southern Ins. Co.*, Erie County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 95-CV-157 (Ohio 1995) (insurance fraud)
- *Smolik v. The Lincoln Electric Company*, Cuyahoga County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 288514 (Ohio 1996) (executive bonus comp plan)
- *In Re Corrpro Securities Litigation*, U.S. Dist. Court Case No. 5:95 CV 1223 (N.D. Ohio 1997) (securities)
- *Cope, et al. v. Metro Life Ins. Co.*, 82 Ohio St.3d 426 (1998)(establishing the ability to sue for uniform written misstatements in order to satisfy the Rule 23 predominance requirement)
- *Shaver v. The Standard Oil Company*, 135 Ohio App.3d 242 (Huron Co. 1999)(breach of fiduciary duty)
- *Everett v. Verizon Wireless, et al.*, No. 3:00-CV-7763 (N.D. Ohio 2000) (consumer)
- *Gomez v. Towne Bancorp*, 129 F.Supp.2d 1116 (N.D. Ohio 2000) (breach of contract by stock escrow agent in connection with a best efforts securities offering)
- *Toledo Blade Pension Plan v. Investment Performance Services*, No. 3:04-CV-7123 (N.D. Ohio 2004) (breach of contract)
- *Miller, et al. v. Volkswagen of America*, Erie County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 2004-CV-558 (Ohio 2004) (consumer/automobile protection)
- *Hepp, George et al. v. Michael Brown et al.*, Seneca County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 52964 (Ohio 2004) (fraudulent sale of viatical settlements)
- *NicSand, Inc. v. 3M Co.*, 507 F.3d 442, 2007 U.S. App. LEXIS 24270, 2007 FED App. 0424P (6th Cir.), 2007-2 Trade Cas. (CCH) P75,908 concerning the illegality of exclusive dealing agreements those foreclose significant percentages of the retail market)
- *Schemmer, et al. v. ChartOne, Inc.*, N.D. Ohio No. 1:05-CV-02923, 2007 WL 1822274 (fraud)
- *MPW Industrial Services Group, Ltd.* U.S. Dist. Court Case No. 2:07-cv-442 (S.D. Ohio 2007) (proxy and 10b-5 class action securities fraud)
- *Firelands Reg. Med. Ctr. v. Jeavons*, 2008 WL 4408600 (Erie County, Ohio) (uninsured protection)
- *Midland Funding LLC v. Brent, et al.*, 3:08-CV-01434, 2009 WL 3437243 (N.D. Ohio 2008) (consumer credit)
- *Molesky, et al. v. State Collection & Recovery Services, Inc.*, N.D. Ohio No. 3:12-cv-2639 (F.D.C.P.A.)
- *Polinsky v. Community Health Partners Regional Health Systems*, U.S. District Court Case No. 1:10-CV-02544 (N.D. Ohio 2010) (F.D.C.P.A. case)
- *Streeter v. Mercy Health System-Northern Region*, CI 200903601 (Lucas Co., OH)

(consumer)

- *Anderson v. Barclays Capital Real Estate, Inc. d.b.a. HomEq Servicing*, U.S. District Court Case No. 3:09-CV-2335 (N.D. Ohio 2009) (consumer)
- *Stammco LLC v. United Telephone Co. of Ohio*, 125 Ohio St.3d 91 (Ohio 2010) (telephone cramming)
- *Pevets v. Crain Communications*, 2011-Ohio-2700 (Ohio 6th Dist. 2011) (breach of contract)
- *Franklin v. Midland Funding, LLC*, 2011 U.S. Dist LEXIS 89919 (N.D. Ohio 2011) (F.D.C.P.A.)
- *Martha Vassalle, et al. v. Midland Funding LLC, et al.*, U.S. District Court Case No. 3:11-cv-0096 (N.D. Ohio 2011) (debt collection case F.D.C.P.A.)
- *Baker v. American Greetings Corp.*, N.D. Ohio No. 1:12-cv-00065 (company owned life insurance (COLI) placed without knowledge or consent)
- *Johnson v. Midland Credit Management, Inc.*, Case No. 1:05-CV-1094 (N.D. Ohio, December 12, 2013) (F.D.C.P.A.)
- *Arlington Video, Inc. v. Fifth Third Bancorp*, 515 Fed. Appx 426 (6th Cir. 2013)
- *Oatman v. InfoCision, Inc., et al.*, 2013 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 106453 (N.D. Ohio 2013) (telemarketing)
- *Fowler, et al. v. ABJ Equipfix, LLC*, U.S. District Court Case No. 3:11-CV-2251 (N.D. Ohio 2013) (employment)
- *PNC National Bank Association v. Mark A. Stuckey, et al.* Erie County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 2013-CV-0634 (Ohio) (excess forced placement of property insurance)
- *Sonia Filby, et al. v. Windsor Mold USA, Inc.*, U.S. District Court Case No. 3:13-CV-01582 (N.D. Ohio 2013) (employment)
- *Jerry Hunt, et al. v. YRC Worldwide, Inc., et al.*, U.S. District Court Case No. 2:13-cv-993 (S.D. Ohio 2013) (employment)
- *Charles Johnson, et al. v. Ford Motor Company*, U.S. District Court Case No. 3:13-cv-6529 (S.D. West Virginia 2013) (product)
- *George Ressler v. Wallace Ackley, et al.*, U.S. District Court Case No. 2:16-cv-86 (S.D. Ohio 2016) (landlord/tenant)
- *James Miller v. Peggybank.com LLC, et al.*, U.S. District Court Case No. 1:16-CV-1011 (N.D. Ohio 2016) (consumer fraud)
- *E. Velasquez, et al. v. Quesadillas, Inc.*, Erie County Court of Common Pleas Case No. 17-CV-007 (Ohio) (employment)
- *Zehentbauer Family Land, LP v. Chesapeake Expl., L.L.C.*, 935 F.3d 496, 2019 U.S. App. LEXIS 24289, 2019 FED App. 0198P (6th Cir.), 104 Fed. R. Serv. 3d (Callaghan) 867, 2019 WL 3820259

**EXHIBIT 2**

**Murray & Murray Co., L.P.A.  
Summary by Timekeeper and Activity**

---

<b><u>Attorney</u></b>	<b><u>Rate</u></b>	<b><u>Hours</u></b>	<b><u>Lodestar</u></b>
William H. Bartle	\$325.00	203.75	\$66,218.75
Nolan E. Murray	\$340.00	13.70	\$4,658.00
Dennis E. Murray	\$495.00	538.10	\$266,359.50
Margaret M. Murray	\$450.00	424.75	\$191,137.50
<b><u>Total</u></b>			<b><u>\$528,373.75</u></b>

# Transactions 2. Murray Case Cost Report Summary

Search for: 0620009 Search by: Matter ID Stage: WIP Type: All costs

Date	Prof	Case #	Narrative	Component	Units	Price	Ext. Amount
------	------	--------	-----------	-----------	-------	-------	-------------

**Matter ID: 0620009**      **Jacob Smith v. FirstEnergy Corporation and FirstEnergy Service**  
**Client: Smith, Jacob**

**Advance Expense Costs****Component Type: Soft Costs**

<b>Component: C</b>					
12 Transactions	Copy Reproduction Costs	Component: C	537.00		80.55
<b>Component: P</b>					
26 Transactions	Postage Costs	Component: P	63.00		30.19
<b>Component: T</b>					
34 Transactions	Long Distance Telephone Call Costs	Component: T	1,443.65		43.30
<b>Total Component Type: Soft Costs</b>			2,043.65 Qty		\$154.04

**Advance Expense Costs****Component Type: Hard Costs**

<b>Component: AE Conf Ca</b>					
1 Transactions	Telephone, Video Conference Call	Component: AE	1.00		36.56
<b>Component: AE Court R</b>					
3 Transactions	Court Reporter & Transcription	Component: AE	3.00		1,063.86
<b>Component: AE Deliver</b>					
2 Transactions	Delivery Service - UPS, Air Borne, Federal Express, USPS, DHL, etc.	Component: AE	2.00		49.36
<b>Component: AE E Res</b>					
11 Transactions	Research, Review, Deposition, Evaluation, Investigation, Site Inspection, Reconstruction, Medical Review or Evaluation.	Component: AE E	11.00		6,242.25
<b>Component: AE FF</b>					
5 Transactions	Filing Fees, Court Costs, Court Entry & Administrative Fees, Jury Deposit, Service of Complaint, Title Service, Open Guardianship, electronic filing etc.	Component: AE FF	5.00		810.00
<b>Component: AE Medit A</b>					
11 Transactions	Mediation or Arbitration	Component: AE	11.00		3,114.19
<b>Component: AE Researc</b>					
9 Transactions	Electronic Computer Research. West Law, Lexis-Nexis, OPEN, Premise, Pacer, Internet Research Services, etc.	Component: AE	9.00		289.50

<b>Total Component Type: Hard Costs</b>	42.00 Qty	\$11,605.72
---	-----------	-------------

<b>TOTAL SOFT &amp; HARD COSTS EXPENSE</b>	2,085.65 Qty	\$ 11,759.76
--	--------------	--------------

Smith, Jacob

<b>Matter ID: 0620009 Case Total</b>	2,085.65 Qty	\$11,759.76
--------------------------------------	--------------	-------------

**Jacob Smith v. FirstEnergy Corporation and FirstEnergy Service**

# Transactions 2. Murray Case Cost Report Summary

---

Search for: 0620009 Search by: Matter ID Stage: WIP Type: All costs

Date	Prof	Case #	Narrative	Component	Units	Price	Ext. Amount
<b>Grand Totals :</b>					<b>2,085.65</b>		<b>11,759.76</b>